

**Replication and Evidence Factors in
Observational Studies**

Paul R. Rosenbaum

Table of Contents

Contents

Preface	xiii
I Background: Aspects of Causal Inference	1
1 Causal Inference in Randomized Experiments	3
1.1 A Randomized Experiment	3
1.2 Structure and Notation	5
1.3 Covariates and Outcomes	8
1.4 Causal Effects with Two Treatment Groups	13
1.5 Inference with Random Assignment	16
1.6 Randomization Tests for Continuous Outcomes	18
1.7 Confidence Sets for Causal Effects	20
1.8 The General Situation	24
1.9 Summary: Randomization Simplifies Causal Inference	25
1.10 Using R	25
2 Causal Inference in Observational Studies	27
2.1 How Are Observational Studies Different From Experiments?	27
2.2 Sensitivity Analysis	29
2.3 *Another Example of Sensitivity Analysis	36
2.4 Design Sensitivity	40
2.5 Summary: Biased Treatment Assignment	45
2.6 Using R	46
2.7 Exercises	48
3 Replication and its Limits	51
3.1 Biases Can Replicate	51
3.2 Some Perspectives	53
3.3 Replications that Disrupt Some Potential Biases	60
3.4 Instruments and Replication	62
3.5 Summary: Replication is Not Repetition	64

II	Evidence Factors in Practice	67
4	Examples of Studies with Evidence Factors	69
4.1	Smoking and Periodontal Disease	69
4.2	Antineoplastic Drugs and DNA Damage	75
4.3	Lead Absorption in Children	81
4.4	Minimum Wages and Employment	84
4.5	Benzene and Chromosome Aberrations	88
4.6	Summary: Mutually Supporting, Unrelated Comparisons	89
4.7	Using R	90
4.8	Exercises	91
5	Simple Analyses with Evidence Factors	95
5.1	Structure of the Simple Analyses	95
5.2	Antineoplastic Drugs and DNA Damage	102
5.3	Smoking and Periodontal Disease	105
5.4	Factors that Do Not Concur	110
5.5	Summary: Strengthen Evidence of Cause and Effect	111
5.6	Using R	112
5.7	Exercises	115
6	Planned Analyses with Evidence Factors	117
6.1	Closed Testing with Three Factors	117
6.2	Confidence Intervals for Magnitudes of Effect	120
6.3	Evidence Factors Plus An Incompatible Comparison	124
6.4	Summary: Planned Analyses Can Accomplish More	133
6.5	Using R	134
6.6	Exercises	136
III	Theory of Evidence Factors	137
7	Dependent P-Values	139
7.1	Dependent P -values Larger than Uniform	139
7.2	Jointly Larger Than Uniform	140
7.3	Creating Jointly Valid, Possibly Dependent P -values	142
7.4	Combining Jointly Valid, Possibly Dependent P -values	144
7.5	Summary: Dependent P -values Jointly Larger than Uniform	146
7.6	Exercises	146
8	Treatment Assignments as Permutations	147
8.1	Formalizing Intuition About Unrelated Pieces of Evidence	147
8.2	Individuals, Strata and Treatment Positions	149
8.3	Permutation Matrices	151
8.4	Pick Matrices	152
8.5	Direct Sums of Permutation Matrices	153

8.6	Subpick Matrices	154
8.7	Treatments with Doses	157
8.8	Permuting Strata of the Same Size	159
8.9	Permuting Several Permutation Matrices	160
8.10	Doing Several Things at Once	162
8.11	Summary: A Treatment Assignment is a Permutation	164
8.12	Complement: Split Matrices	164
8.13	Exercises	165
9	Sets of Treatment Assignments	167
9.1	Sets of Permutation Matrices	167
9.2	Products of Sets	168
9.3	Unique Representation As a Product of Two Factors	169
9.4	*Closure	171
9.5	Summary: Factoring Sets of Treatment Assignments	172
9.6	Exercises	172
10	Probability Distributions for Treatment Assignments	173
10.1	One Distribution	173
10.2	A Set of Distributions	175
10.3	*Some Technical Remarks and Definitions	177
10.4	Sensitivity Analysis	178
10.5	Summary: Probability on a Set of Treatment Assignments	183
10.6	Complement: Sensitivity Analysis with Doses	183
10.7	Exercises	184
11	Factors	185
11.1	Marginal and Conditional Distributions	185
11.2	Joint Distribution of Two Sensitivity Analyses	186
11.3	Sets of Marginal and Conditional Distributions	187
11.4	Ignoring a Factor	189
11.5	Conditioning on a Factor	190
11.6	Combining Two Sensitivity Analyses	191
11.7	Summary: Combining Two Sensitivity Analyses	193
11.8	Complement: More Than Two Factors	193
11.9	Exercises	194
12	*Groups of Permutation Matrices	195
12.1	Why Groups?	195
12.2	Groups	195
12.3	Groups in Evidence Factors: Some Examples	198
12.4	Group Products	199
12.5	Summary: Groups Provide the Needed Factors	202

IV Aspects of Design	205
13 Constructing Matched Samples with Evidence Factors	207
13.1 Aspects of Design	207
13.2 Nearly Optimal Complete Blocks	211
13.3 Optimal Incomplete Block Designs	213
13.4 Variation in Treatment Within and Between Institutions	215
13.5 Comparing Study Designs: Which Design is Best?	218
13.6 Summary: Build Evidence Factors into the Design	221
13.7 Using R	221
14 Design Elements for Evidence Factors	223
14.1 Some Common Design Elements	223
14.2 *Symmetric Sets of Biases	225
Bibliography	227
Index	247